



# WBG SCORECARD FY24-FY30 METHODOLOGY NOTE

## WBG Results Indicator

The purpose of this note is to ensure the rigor, transparency, and reproducibility of the WBG results indicators included in the new WBG Scorecard FY24-FY30, as well as their alignment with the WBG’s vision. Technical teams were asked to provide a sufficiently detailed methodology so that anyone who reads this note can understand its rationale, theory of change, data sources, and method of calculation.

Definitions included in this template are aligned to the WBG Scorecard paper endorsed by the Board on Dec 19, 2023. The methods notes are living documents and will be subject to updating and revision pending operational inputs and implementation lessons over time.

OVERVIEW																			
<b>INDICATOR NAME</b>	<b>Millions of people using broadband internet</b>																		
<b>SUB-INDICATORS</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• People using broadband internet (new use)</li> <li>• People using broadband internet (inferred use)</li> <li>• People using broadband internet (enhanced use)</li> </ul>																		
<b>OUTCOME AREA</b>	<table border="0"> <tr> <td><input type="checkbox"/> Protection for the Poorest</td> <td><input type="checkbox"/> No Learning Poverty</td> </tr> <tr> <td><input type="checkbox"/> Healthier Lives</td> <td><input type="checkbox"/> Effective Macroeconomics and Fiscal Management</td> </tr> <tr> <td><input type="checkbox"/> Green and blue planet and resilient populations</td> <td><input type="checkbox"/> Inclusive and equitable water and sanitation services</td> </tr> <tr> <td><input type="checkbox"/> Sustainable food systems</td> <td><input type="checkbox"/> Connected Communities</td> </tr> <tr> <td><input type="checkbox"/> Affordable, reliable, and sustainable energy for all</td> <td><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Digital connectivity</td> </tr> <tr> <td><input type="checkbox"/> Digital services</td> <td><input type="checkbox"/> Gender equality and youth inclusion</td> </tr> <tr> <td><input type="checkbox"/> More and Better Jobs</td> <td><input type="checkbox"/> Better Lives for People in Fragility, Conflict, and Violence</td> </tr> <tr> <td></td> <td><input type="checkbox"/> More private investments</td> </tr> </table>	<input type="checkbox"/> Protection for the Poorest	<input type="checkbox"/> No Learning Poverty	<input type="checkbox"/> Healthier Lives	<input type="checkbox"/> Effective Macroeconomics and Fiscal Management	<input type="checkbox"/> Green and blue planet and resilient populations	<input type="checkbox"/> Inclusive and equitable water and sanitation services	<input type="checkbox"/> Sustainable food systems	<input type="checkbox"/> Connected Communities	<input type="checkbox"/> Affordable, reliable, and sustainable energy for all	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Digital connectivity	<input type="checkbox"/> Digital services	<input type="checkbox"/> Gender equality and youth inclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> More and Better Jobs	<input type="checkbox"/> Better Lives for People in Fragility, Conflict, and Violence		<input type="checkbox"/> More private investments		
<input type="checkbox"/> Protection for the Poorest	<input type="checkbox"/> No Learning Poverty																		
<input type="checkbox"/> Healthier Lives	<input type="checkbox"/> Effective Macroeconomics and Fiscal Management																		
<input type="checkbox"/> Green and blue planet and resilient populations	<input type="checkbox"/> Inclusive and equitable water and sanitation services																		
<input type="checkbox"/> Sustainable food systems	<input type="checkbox"/> Connected Communities																		
<input type="checkbox"/> Affordable, reliable, and sustainable energy for all	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Digital connectivity																		
<input type="checkbox"/> Digital services	<input type="checkbox"/> Gender equality and youth inclusion																		
<input type="checkbox"/> More and Better Jobs	<input type="checkbox"/> Better Lives for People in Fragility, Conflict, and Violence																		
	<input type="checkbox"/> More private investments																		
<b>SDG ALIGNMENT</b>	<p>See <a href="https://sdgs.un.org/">https://sdgs.un.org/</a> for further details on SDGs:</p> <table border="0"> <tr> <td><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 1. No Poverty</td> <td><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 10. Reduced Inequalities</td> </tr> <tr> <td><input type="checkbox"/> 2. Zero Hunger</td> <td><input type="checkbox"/> 11. Sustainable Cities and Communities</td> </tr> <tr> <td><input type="checkbox"/> 3. Good Health and Well-being</td> <td><input type="checkbox"/> 12. Responsible Consumption and Production</td> </tr> <tr> <td><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 4. Quality Education</td> <td><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 13. Climate Action</td> </tr> <tr> <td><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 5. Gender Equality</td> <td><input type="checkbox"/> 14. Life Below Water</td> </tr> <tr> <td><input type="checkbox"/> 6. Clean Water and Sanitation</td> <td><input type="checkbox"/> 15. Life on Land</td> </tr> <tr> <td><input type="checkbox"/> 7. Affordable and Clean Energy</td> <td><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 16. Peace, Justice and Strong Institutions</td> </tr> <tr> <td><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 8. Decent Work and Economic Growth</td> <td><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 17. Partnerships for the Goals</td> </tr> <tr> <td><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 9. Industry Innovation and Infrastructure</td> <td></td> </tr> </table> <p>List of specific UN targets (if applicable):</p>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 1. No Poverty	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 10. Reduced Inequalities	<input type="checkbox"/> 2. Zero Hunger	<input type="checkbox"/> 11. Sustainable Cities and Communities	<input type="checkbox"/> 3. Good Health and Well-being	<input type="checkbox"/> 12. Responsible Consumption and Production	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 4. Quality Education	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 13. Climate Action	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 5. Gender Equality	<input type="checkbox"/> 14. Life Below Water	<input type="checkbox"/> 6. Clean Water and Sanitation	<input type="checkbox"/> 15. Life on Land	<input type="checkbox"/> 7. Affordable and Clean Energy	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 16. Peace, Justice and Strong Institutions	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 8. Decent Work and Economic Growth	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 17. Partnerships for the Goals	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 9. Industry Innovation and Infrastructure	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 1. No Poverty	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 10. Reduced Inequalities																		
<input type="checkbox"/> 2. Zero Hunger	<input type="checkbox"/> 11. Sustainable Cities and Communities																		
<input type="checkbox"/> 3. Good Health and Well-being	<input type="checkbox"/> 12. Responsible Consumption and Production																		
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 4. Quality Education	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 13. Climate Action																		
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 5. Gender Equality	<input type="checkbox"/> 14. Life Below Water																		
<input type="checkbox"/> 6. Clean Water and Sanitation	<input type="checkbox"/> 15. Life on Land																		
<input type="checkbox"/> 7. Affordable and Clean Energy	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 16. Peace, Justice and Strong Institutions																		
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 8. Decent Work and Economic Growth	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 17. Partnerships for the Goals																		
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 9. Industry Innovation and Infrastructure																			
<b>DISAGGREGATION</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Youth <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Sex <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Disability-inclusive <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> FCS <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> SS, SIDS and LDCs <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> IDA, IBRD, IFC and MIGA <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Country income groups <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Regions <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> WBG Joint Programming																		
<b>ENGAGEMENT TYPE</b>	<p><b>WORLD BANK</b></p> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> IBRD <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> IDA <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Trust Fund (TF) <input type="checkbox"/> Advisory Services and Analytics (ASA) <input type="checkbox"/> Treasury Products (including technical assistance) <p><b>IFC</b></p> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> IFC Investment <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> IFC Upstream and Advisory Services <p><b>MIGA</b></p> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> MIGA Guarantee																		
	<b>WORLD BANK</b>																		

<b>ENGAGEMENT INSTRUMENT</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> IPFs <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> DPFs <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> PforR <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Guarantees <input type="checkbox"/> TF: IDA <input type="checkbox"/> TF: IBRD <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> TF: RETF <sup>1</sup> <input type="checkbox"/> TF: GEF <sup>2</sup> <input type="checkbox"/> TF: MONT <sup>3</sup> <input type="checkbox"/> TF: SPF <sup>4</sup> <input type="checkbox"/> ASA: BB <sup>5</sup> <input type="checkbox"/> ASA: BETFs/EFOs <sup>6</sup> <input type="checkbox"/> ASA: RAS <sup>7</sup>  <b>IFC</b> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Loans <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Equity <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Blended Finance <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Syndications <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Asset Management <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advisory Services <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Trade and Commodity Finance <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Treasury Client Solutions  <b>MIGA</b> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Political Risk Insurance <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Credit Enhancement <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Trade Finance Guarantees
<b>LEGACY INDICATOR NAME</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> WB Old Scorecard indicator: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> WBG Old Scorecard indicator: [People provided with new or enhanced access to broadband internet (million)] <input type="checkbox"/> N/A
<b>RATIONALE</b>	
<b>DEFINITION</b>	<p>The number of people, public sector facilities, businesses who use new or enhanced internet broadband facilitated through support by IBRD, IDA, IFC, and MIGA. It includes people who were previously unconnected and are new users of broadband internet (new use and inferred use) and people who have benefitted from improved broadband internet service during the project implementation period. Use is measured as the number of subscribers to broadband internet. Subscribers who pay for internet services are typically frequent users and data on mobile subscribers tracks active users (GSMA). New or enhanced use at a business or public facility, or via a public access point, will be converted into an estimated number of people beneficiaries for the purpose of aggregation as relevant and mentions of people below will include people benefitting through businesses or public sector facilities.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ <b>New use</b> is defined as the number of beneficiaries (people) that have become new subscribers to internet service, when they had not been in the past, as a result of last mile investments and interventions, such as connecting households, villages, schools, health centers, businesses, or other facilities. On the IFC side, beneficiaries of investments in MNOs are captured here.</li> <li>○ <b>Inferred use</b> is defined as the number of beneficiaries (people) who have become new subscribers to internet service as a result of investments and interventions at the first or middle mile / upstream segments of the value chain, with the impact occurring further down the results chain (see below for an overview of sample interventions).</li> <li>○ <b>Enhanced use</b> is defined as the number of people with existing subscriptions that have benefitted from improved broadband internet. Improved use refers to enhanced download and upload speeds, better quality through lower latency and jitter as well as lower prices for data services. It can also refer to improved resilience of networks, for example through lower frequency of internet disruptions and downtime.</li> </ul> <p>Internet use can occur on fixed or mobile broadband networks and can be at any location (such as, home, work, school, public facilities, internet cafés, public places, etc.). Depending on project focus, data on mobile and/or fixed subscribers is used to calculate internet users.</p>

<sup>1</sup> RETF: Recipient Executed Trust Fund

<sup>2</sup> GEF: Global Environment Facility

<sup>3</sup> MONT: Montreal Protocol

<sup>4</sup> SPF: Special financing

<sup>5</sup> Bank's own administrative budget (BB).

<sup>6</sup> Donors (via Bank-executed Trust Funds (BETFs) or Externally Financed Outputs (EFOs).

<sup>7</sup> Clients (via Reimbursable Advisory Services (RAS).

<b>REPORTING TIMELINE</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Results achieved <sup>8</sup> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Results expected <sup>9</sup>
<b>DIRECT/INDIRECT</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Direct <sup>10</sup> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Indirect <sup>11</sup>
<b>ACTUALS/ MODEL-BASED</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Actuals <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Model-based
<b>UNIT OF MEASURE</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Number of people <input type="checkbox"/> Number of countries <input type="checkbox"/> USD <input type="checkbox"/> GW <input type="checkbox"/> Hectares <input type="checkbox"/> tCO <sub>2</sub> eq/year <input type="checkbox"/> Other: _____ [Please specify]
<b>THEORY OF CHANGE</b>	<p><b>Please see Annex 1 for a visualization of the theory of change.</b></p> <p>The typical challenges in connectivity are characterized by low/uneven access to and usage of broadband, especially in rural areas and among women; high costs of broadband services and devices that prevent acquisition of required services and/or devices; and gaps in the legal, regulatory, and policy framework related to telecom and the broader digital economy that have a negative impact on private investment and affordability.</p> <p><b>Activities associated with tackling such challenges include:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Improving the regulatory framework and market competition.</li> <li>• improving legal, regulatory, and institutional capacity for broadband market development.</li> <li>• Policy and regulatory changes to improve service and/or device affordability.</li> <li>• Investing in broadband connectivity infrastructure or services (first-, middle-, last mile): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ <b>First:</b> access to submarine cables, satellites, expansion of cross-border networks,</li> <li>○ <b>Middle mile:</b> Investment in the fiber optic backbone, metro networks, and data centers,</li> <li>○ <b>Last mile:</b> Connecting individuals, households, businesses, schools, public buildings, facilities; expanding last mile connectivity in rural and remote areas.</li> <li>○ Investing in device affordability: e.g., subsidies, risk-sharing facilities, supply chain finance, securitization of receivables, asset financing.</li> </ul> </li> </ul> <p>These in turn produce the adoption of improved regulations and policies and greater regulatory capacity to support telecommunications market development; additional broadband networks (backbone links, access networks, etc.) and data center facilities built and operated; improvement to broadband networks, including to increase resiliency to climate-related shocks, adding capacity and upgrading networks; facilities and sites connected (private, public); and availability of affordable devices.</p> <p>The systemic change following includes competitive telecommunications markets; expanded, climate-resilient broadband networks and regional digital infrastructure (e.g., km of fiber optic cables, mobile broadband coverage, fiber-to-the-premises, connected sites and facilities, climate-resilient infrastructure); better network quality (e.g., mean download speeds, international bandwidth or traffic per capita, upgraded digital infra to improve climate resilience, mean down time per month); more affordable digital devices and data plans (retail and wholesale); and access to</p>

<sup>8</sup> New WBG Scorecard paper (Section G): it refers to *results that have occurred* at a given moment of the projects' results horizon. *Results achieved* can be based on actuals at the project level or can use model-based estimations at the portfolio level relying always on available project level data inputs.

<sup>9</sup> New WBG Scorecard paper (Section G): it refers to the *anticipated results* over the projects' results horizon. *Expected results* is based on the latest available estimations of future results, including model-based or other informed estimations.

<sup>10</sup> New WBG Scorecard paper (Annex I, Technical Criteria): it refers to outcomes with sufficient causal proximity to WBG interventions to allow for attribution of results.

<sup>11</sup> New WBG Scorecard paper (Annex I, Technical Criteria): it refers to outcomes where attribution is located further down the causal chain, relative to WBG interventions, and may be contingent on other exogenous factors.

broadband-enabled devices. The associated outcomes and benefit to users include expanded access to affordable broadband connectivity; and improved internet quality: speeds, latency, reliability.

**Outcome type/subtypes from the IEG taxonomies developed in Results and Performance of the World Bank Group Annual Review (RAP) 2021 mapped to the outcome(s) measured by the indicator.<sup>12</sup>**

**WORLD BANK**

- A. Access to services expanded
- D. Quality of services improved
- E. Capacity of institutions to perform institutional functions enhanced
- G. Use of services or assets increased
- H. Legal or regulatory context improved
- P. Equity or inclusion enhanced

**IFC**

- 1.1. Access to goods and services
- 1.2. Quality/affordability of goods and services
- 1.5. Improved sales and profitability of enterprises
- 3.2. Improved capacity or skills
- 3.1. Increased employment
- 6.3. Efficient use of resources

**MIGA**

- 1.1. Access to goods and services
- 1.2. Quality/affordability of goods and services
- 1.5. Improved sales and profitability of enterprises
- 3.2. Improved capacity or skills
- 3.1. Increased employment
- 6.3. Efficient use of resources

**OUTCOME TYPE/  
SUBTYPE**

**INCLUSION  
CRITERIA**

**The following interventions can contribute to this indicator:**

- Improving the regulatory framework and market competition; improving legal, regulatory, and institutional capacity for broadband market development
- Policy and regulatory changes to improve the affordability of internet service and/or devices, including through end-user subsidies or risk-sharing/guarantee schemes.
- Investing in device affordability: e.g., subsidies, risk-sharing facilities, supply chain finance, securitization of receivables, asset financing
- Investing in broadband connectivity infrastructure or services (first-, middle-, last mile):
  - **First:** access to submarine cables, satellites, expansion of cross-border networks
  - **Middle mile:** Investment in the fiber optic backbone, metro networks, and data centers
  - **Last mile:** Connecting individuals, households, businesses, schools, public buildings, facilities; expanding last mile connectivity in rural and remote areas

**To be included in the indicator, the following intermediate outcomes will be considered:**

- **New/Inferred access** (direct in last mile, indirect in first- and middle-mile): such as expanded and climate-resilient national broadband networks and regional digital infrastructure (e.g., km of fiber optic cables, mobile broadband coverage, fiber-to-the-premises, connected sites and facilities, climate-resilient infrastructure). Climate resilient will be defined as per the guidance being developed by Digital Development.

<sup>12</sup> Independent Evaluation Group: [RAP 2021](#).

- **New access** (direct): Access to broadband-enabled devices
- **Enhanced access**: Better network quality (e.g., mean download speeds, international bandwidth or traffic per capita, upgraded digital infra to improve climate resilience, mean down time per month)
- **Enhanced access**: Reduced prices of broadband services (retail and wholesale)

## ADVANTAGES

Digitalization has been recognized as a key accelerator of development both within the Bank Group, not least in the creation of a new digital VPU and the Global Challenge Program on digitalization, and externally for accelerating progress towards the SDGs. This indicator reports on progress in the foundational aspect of digitalization – access to the internet. With roughly 2.6 billion people who remain unconnected in 2023 (ITU) and a lack of fast, reliable, and affordable connectivity in many LMIC, the benefits of digitalization are unevenly spread, and large parts of the population remain excluded. Building and improving broadband networks and advising on policy and regulation to improve internet quality and affordability of devices and services is key to improving internet access and use.

The indicator focuses on people, who are ultimately the users of internet services. Recognizing the importance of providing internet access in all aspects of life, including privately/at home, at work, in health and education, at public places, etc., the indicator summarizes progress across all these dimensions across WBG projects. The indicator is oriented towards outcomes by counting people using the internet and not those who enjoy network coverage. As with the previous indicator, this data proxies for internet use by individuals with data on mobile and fixed broadband subscribers. A key advantage is that these data points are widely available, of high quality, updated regularly, and can be reported across Bank Group projects.

Methodologically, this definition improves on the previous indicator in several ways:

1. By clarifying the components of the indicator (direct-, indirect new, enhanced), the indicator can now be aggregated with IFC and MIGA reporting, creating a single World Bank Group indicator.
2. The updated methodology establishes guidance on activities and intermediate outcomes that need to be present to count new, inferred, and enhanced use.
3. This indicator allows contribution by other GPs through broadband provision at the business and public facility level, which is converted into number of people affected and reported as direct new access.

## LIMITATIONS

This indicator relies on subscriber data for mobile and fixed services to proxy for internet use by individuals. The calculation methodology adopts several approaches to reduce overcounting. There is some risk of overcounting internet users:

1. There is potential overcounting of people who have access to both mobile and fixed internet. For example, people may subscribe to a mobile plan but also use Wi-Fi at their school or workplace or have a fixed subscription at home. To overcome this, only mobile or fixed subscriptions will be counted towards inferred use or enhanced use, depending on project focus or whichever data is highest (unless interventions happened in separate distinct geographic areas or is covering distinct groups of users). It is also worth noting that there is undercounting associated with the subscriptions approach, as both mobile and fixed broadband subscriptions can be shared. Fixed subscriptions may be shared among multiple people, but only one is counted.
2. There may be overcounting when there is more than one operation addressing connectivity challenges (including different instruments such as IPFs, PforRs and DPFs) active in the same country. Regardless of the instrument, where users cannot be separated either by geographic area or demographics, only the project with the highest number of users counted.
3. There may be overcounting of World Bank, IFC and MIGA projects, where both institutions are active in the same country and same project or broader reform/investment. The data will be reported on separately for each institution to avoid overcounting.

4. IFC reporting may involve overcounting: For instance, IFC may invest in several wholesale operators within a country (e.g., submarine cable, data centers or towers operators) serving the same end-users. See below for the methodology of how this is addressed. IFC may also invest in last-mile connectivity providers in a country (e.g., MNOs or wholesale ISPs) with overlapping subscribers.
5. There is some overcounting of direct new access in World Bank projects, i.e., where villages, public facilities, or public places are connected, as not all these people will make use of the newly provided connectivity or may already be connected otherwise. To account for this, a *usage factor* is applied<sup>13</sup>.
6. There are cases where people may have a subscription, but do not use the internet, for example due to lack of digital literacy, social norms, or a lack of relevant content. While there is limited data on this phenomenon, we expect it to be marginal compared to the usage gap, which is the difference between those being covered by mobile or fixed networks and those subscribing to services.

Several factors could influence the strength of contribution to this indicator. For instance, IFC's corporate finance or equity investments may not be linked to a specific operation within the company. Attribution will be enhanced through a clear definition of intentionality and strong linkages between project activities and the expected outcomes through well-designed theories of change across WBG projects in support of claims of contribution. Outdated data can be an issue for subscriber data in ISRs – as they may not coincide exactly with the reporting period of the scorecard- and which is used to report on new access and enhanced access on an economy-wide basis, as subscriptions data are changing more frequently.<sup>14</sup> This may be the case, where reporting agencies do not regularly update these figures. Wherever economy-wide data on mobile or fixed access is used, the main external data sources should be used: GSMA (unique mobile internet subscribers) and Telegeography (Fiber/Lan subscriptions), which are reported on a quarterly basis.

## DATA AND CALCULATION

### INTERNAL DATA SOURCE(S)

- World Bank's Operations Portal (PADs, PDs, ISRs, and ICRs)
- World Bank's Operations Portal (Lending and Portfolio)
- IFC Operational Portal (iDesk/iPortal)
- IFC AIMM System
- MIGA DEIS
- MIGA Portfolio Records
- Other: *World Bank*: supplementary updated data when reporting (ISRs and ICRs) does not take place exactly at the end of the FY.

### METHOD OF CALCULATION (CORE)

#### WORLD BANK:

As relevant, the data will be collected from administrative records in government agencies (e.g., regulator, ministries), investees, or external sources such as TeleGeography (fixed Fiber/LAN internet subscriptions) and GSMA (unique mobile internet subscribers).

- **New use** (direct) is counted if the project finances last mile investments such as connecting rural villages, schools, hospitals, or public wi-fi spots and may report the number of new users over the project implementation period, via project implementation units. To convert businesses to people, the average size of SMEs will be used as a multiplier. For other institutions (schools, hospitals), conversion to people will be considered on a case-by-case basis in consultation with project teams. Where the data for new use reports the number of people provided with new access to the internet (new broadband coverage), a *usage factor* is applied. This factor is  $(1 - [\text{usage gap}])$ , with the

<sup>13</sup> usage gap being the share of the population covered (population covered by mobile internet) that is not subscribed to mobile broadband internet in the respective country (broadband penetration of mobile internet)

<sup>14</sup> Some data will also not be readily available at the subnational level. This limitation is typically resolved at project design when baselines and targets are established. This information can be obtained from either local authorities, local services providers, or through targeted survey to capture the ratio of users vs. non-users. All else being equal, national data can be translated to subnational data using population proportions.

usage gap being the share of the population covered (population covered by mobile internet) that is not subscribed to mobile broadband internet in the respective country (broadband penetration of mobile internet).<sup>15</sup> Relevant data are available on GSMA and Telegeography. Where the data for new use is specific to schools, a *usage factor* is not required because students and teachers provided with internet access will use it.

- **Inferred use** (indirect) is counted if a WB project enables or finances investments in broadband infrastructure in the first- or middle mile of the telecommunications value chain or supports policy and regulatory reforms that enable people to subscribe to fixed or mobile broadband internet. It represents the increase (delta) of fixed and/or unique mobile subscribers over the project implementation period.
- **Enhanced use** is counted if a WB project supports policy and regulatory reforms (and investments) that improve internet quality (speed, latency, frequency of internet outages) or lower prices for internet services for existing subscribers. Enhanced access represents the existing number of fixed and unique mobile subscribers at the start of the project. Supporting activities that aim at enhancing internet quality or reducing prices, as depicted in the project’s theory of change, must be completed (at least one of them), in addition to positive changes in connected intermediate outcome indicators such as change in prices of internet subscription or internet speed to be used as evidence of enhanced services. Projects will also be checked to ensure that enhanced access interventions have not been dropped during project restructuring.
- **Aggregation.** New and inferred use are aggregated. Where inferred use is economy-wide, only inferred use will be counted to avoid double counting. Enhanced use is simply added to new use.

To account for projects that focus on specific districts within a country, the targeted percentage share of the population is sourced from the “Project beneficiaries” section of the Project Appraisal Document and applied to the data reported which sets the baseline for the intervention. Expected results are equal to target users as reflected in the latest documentation (PAD or ISR if targets are updated) minus the baseline. The baseline is set by the project team based on available data collected through surveys/administrative data/external data sources.

#### IFC and MIGA:

IFC and MIGA will consider direct investments/interventions in or guarantee support for companies, and where appropriate IFC will consider indirect investment through sector-specific Private Equity funds.

- To the extent applicable, the following data will be collected from private sector clients to report on this indicator:
  - Number of subscribers (individuals, households, or businesses).
  - Amount of infrastructure operated (e.g., length or bandwidth of submarine cable or terrestrial fiber optic cables, number of mobile broadband base stations, number of tenancies across shared tower sites, and IT power of data centers).
- Household and business subscribers typically come from last-mile fixed broadband Internet projects. They are converted into people-equivalent using the average size of households and businesses respectively.
- For a given IFC or MIGA private sector operation, the number of people using broadband Internet is calculated as follows:
 
$$(1 - \rho)\Delta N + \sigma\Delta Q \quad (1)$$
- $\rho$  represents the growth rate in the number of subscribers absent the project. Such a growth rate is often taken as the historical rate (at the company level if available otherwise apply the national rate) but depends on each project.

<sup>15</sup> Because of missing data, it is not possible to calculate the usage gap for fixed broadband. Hence, the mobile broadband usage gap is taken to calculate the usage factor for fixed broadband.

## METHOD OF CALCULATION (DISAGGREGATION)

- $\Delta N$  is the additional number of individual subscribers with the client in the geography of the operations funded by the WBG between the beginning of the project and the reporting year. The geography is defined following the countries of operations and the digital infrastructure sector involved in IFC investment project. As such,  $(1 - \rho)\Delta N$  corresponds to that part of additional subscribers that can be attributed to the WBG's private sector operation. These operations refer to retail operators that provide broadband Internet access directly to the end users like individuals, households or businesses. The additional subscribers are generally new to our client but may not be first-time users as they may come from competitors. Our client may have also lost some baseline clients to competitors. The balance between existing customers joining our client and those leaving for competitors would constitute the beneficiaries of enhanced broadband Internet, but such a number cannot be calculated separately due to a lack of data.
  - $\Delta Q$  denotes the amount of infrastructure added by the client as part of the project between its inception and the reporting year.
  - $\sigma$  is a multiplier, representing an estimated number of Internet subscribers per unit of digital infrastructure, e.g., the number of Internet subscribers per mobile base station. This multiplier is calculated at the reporting year using project data when available or using data from proprietary sources like the GSMA, Telegeography, and the ITU. As such,  $\sigma\Delta Q$  is the equivalent number of subscribers supported by infrastructure expansion by our clients. These subscribers may be new or existing broadband Internet users.
  - The reported number includes both direct and indirect beneficiaries. Direct beneficiaries are users directly served by IFC and MIGA's clients for which they report the number of subscribers to broadband Internet access. Examples include subscribers of Mobile Network Operators and Internet Service Providers. Indirect beneficiaries are Internet users who gained access through a customer of IFC and MIGA's clients. For instance, the subscriber of an MNO that lease access to tower sites from a tower company supported by the IFC or MIGA would be an indirect beneficiary.
  - Within a country, the indicator is aggregated as follows:
    - For operations within the same business model (e.g., MNOs, broadband, data centers, or towers), the number of broadband Internet users supported is summed across projects or clients depending on the scope of the project (project or corporate finance).
    - For operations across different business models, the maximum number is used. For instance, if IFC or MIGA support an MNO and a tower company in the same country, the maximum number of people using broadband Internet from each operation is taken as the aggregate at the country level.
- 
- **Youth:** Where available, project data disaggregated by age demographics are used. Otherwise, the standardized approach specified in the Corporate Scorecard Disaggregation Methodology is followed, based on the UN definition of youth (15-24).
  - **Sex:** The standardized approach specified in the Corporate Scorecard Disaggregation Methodology is followed. In projects without gender-disaggregated data, the number of female beneficiaries is estimated using data from Gallup World Poll data along with population estimates by the United Nations.<sup>16</sup>
  - **Disability inclusion:** The standardized approach specified in the Corporate Scorecard Disaggregation Methodology is followed.<sup>17</sup>
  - **FCS:** Results are aggregated according to the most recent FCS list.<sup>18</sup>

<sup>16</sup> Based on a comprehensive comparison of digital gender sources, taking into account aspects such as data quality, reporting frequency, country coverage, the best source of gender data is Gallup World Poll followed by International Telecommunication Union. In instances where Gallup World Poll data is missing or outdated, the data is sourced from International Telecommunication Union. The following indicators at country-level are used for estimating the reach to women beneficiaries: Number of women, ages 15+ (UN Population Estimates); Number of adults, ages 15+ (UN Population Estimates); % adults (ages 15+) who use the internet (Gallup World Poll/ITU); % women (ages 15+) who use the internet (Gallup World Poll/ITS).

<sup>17</sup> If the project includes a youth or disability-focused activity or intervention and disaggregates data by status, a simple count or an estimation of the number of disabled/youth beneficiaries is possible. Otherwise, an estimation may be produced depending on the availability of country-level data on the share of broadband Internet users with disability/between the ages of 15 and 24. Incorporation of data regarding youth and disability will be introduced gradually and in phases as the methodology evolves and the data becomes available.

<sup>18</sup> WB: [Classification of Fragile and Conflict-Affected Situations](#)



- **Small States (SS), Small Island Developing States (SIDS), and Least Developed Countries (LDCs):** Results are aggregated according to the most recent list of SS,<sup>19</sup> SIDS,<sup>20</sup> and LDCs.<sup>21</sup>
- **IDA/IBRD:** Project data are used to aggregate results by institution.
- **Region:** Project data are used to aggregate results by WBG region.<sup>22</sup>
- **Country income group:** Results are aggregated according to the income level list.<sup>23</sup>
- **WBG joint programming:** The standardized approach specified in the Corporate Scorecard Results Calculation Handbook is followed.

## QUALITY ASSURANCE PROCESS

All reported numbers at the project level should clearly document the period the indicator covers, the source of the data, the supporting intermediate outcomes that lead to the scorecard indicator – to make the strong link between project activities and increase in users of digitally-enabled services, and if the service is new, inferred or enhanced.<sup>24</sup>

Project teams together with the client should have the proper M&E plans in place to measure the indicator. This should take into consideration the resources to collect the data for the indicator and supporting intermediate outcome indicators during and beyond the lifetime of the project. Client readiness and quality documentation will be essential. Project teams should rapidly address issues of capacity of the client to collect quality data and report and provide with the necessary guidance and support as needed.

Teams reporting on data should watch for completeness, quality and consistency of data. They should be able to detect any outliers and understand their origins before reporting them – this would include beneficiary numbers above the number of a population in one country. Teams should be able to establish a strong link between the reported results and project activities to avoid attribution issues. Common units of measurement should also be adhered to.

## VERSION

Version 1. Revised May 22, 2024.

<sup>19</sup> <https://www.worldbank.org/en/country/smallstates/overview>.

<sup>20</sup> UN List of SIDS: [List of SIDS](#)

<sup>21</sup> UN List of LDCs: [List of LDCs](#)

<sup>22</sup> WBG regions are Africa West, Africa East, East Asia & Pacific, Europe & Central Asia, Latin America & the Caribbean, Middle East & North Africa, and South Asia.

<sup>23</sup> WB Data: [WB Country and Lending Groups](#)

<sup>24</sup> Collectively and across the three institutions and sectors, guidance and training should be provided to project teams and clients as relevant. Periodic interactions should also share lessons and good practices.

# THEORY OF CHANGE FOR DIGITAL DEVELOPMENT

